

## Permission to Appeal results – December 2012

Case name	Justices	PTA	Reasons given
Hawksford Trustees Jersey Limited as Trustee of the Bald Eagle Trust (Appellant) <i>v</i> Stella Global UK Limited and another (Respondents) UKSC 2012/0191	Lord Neuberger Lord Mance Lord Wilson	Refused 6 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise a point of law which should be considered by the Supreme Court at this time.
Huczko (Appellant) <i>v</i> The Governor of HMP Wandsworth and another (Respondents) UKSC 2012/0206	Lord Neuberger Lord Mance Lord Wilson	Refused 6 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law.
IAM Group Plc (Appellant) <i>v</i> Chowdrey (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0197	Lord Neuberger Lord Mance Lord Wilson	Refused 6 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law.
Lomas and others (Respondents) <i>v</i> JFB Firth Rixson Inc and another (Appellants) UKSC 2012/0123	Lord Neuberger Lord Sumption Lord Carnwath	Refused 6 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused. The decision of the Court of Appeal in none of the proposed appeals raises a point of law of general public importance which should be considered by this Court at this time.
Rust Consulting Limited (in Creditors' Voluntary Liquidation) (Respondent) <i>v</i> PB Limited (formerly Kennedy & Donkin Limited) (Appellant) UKSC 2012/0194	Lord Neuberger Lord Mance Lord Wilson	Refused 6 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law on the facts of this case
R (on the application of IA) (by his litigation friend, the Official Solicitor) (FC) (Appellant) <i>v</i> Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government and another (Respondents) UKSC 2012/0131	Lady Hale Lord Mance Lord Carnwath	Refused 7 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused. While the procedural problem might be overcome, the substantive grounds of appeal do not disclose an arguable point of law of general public importance.
In the matter of an application by Martin Corey (A.P.) for Judicial Review (Northern Ireland) UKSC 2012/0217	Lord Hope Lord Kerr Lord Carnwath	Granted 13 Dec 2012	
Shirt (Appellant) and another <i>v</i> Representatives of the Estate of Stanley Edmund Shirt (Deceased) (Respondents) UKSC 2012/0164	Lord Hope Lord Kerr Lord Carnwath	Refused 17 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law of general public importance bearing in mind that the case turned on its own facts.

Cavenagh (Respondent) <i>v</i> William Evans Limited (Appellant) UKSC 2012/0201	Lord Hope Lord Kerr Lord Carnwath	Refused 17 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law of general public importance which ought to be considered by the Supreme Court, bearing in mind that the case has already been the subject of judicial decision and reviewed on appeal.
R (on the application of ClientEarth) (Appellant) <i>v</i> The Secretary of State for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0179	Lord Neuberger Lord Mance Lord Carnwath	Granted 19 Dec 2012	
R <i>v</i> McGowan (Appellant) (Northern Ireland) UKSC 2012/0214	Lord Hope Lord Kerr Lord Carnwath	Refused 19 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law at all.
R (on the application of YZ (China) (Appellant) <i>v</i> The Secretary of State of the Home Department (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0216	Lady Hale Lord Wilson Lord Carnwath	Refused 19 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise a point of law of general public importance.
Charles Terence Estates Limited (Respondent) <i>v</i> Cornwall Council (Appellant) UKSC 2012/0267	Lord Neuberger Lord Mance Lord Carnwath	Refused 20 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law of general public importance which ought to be considered by the Supreme Court at this time. There is no realistic prospect of successfully appealing the first ground of the Court of Appeal's decision.
Gill (Appellant) <i>v</i> Hassan (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0218	Lord Neuberger Lord Sumption Lord Reed	Refused 21 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law of general public importance.
Richardson and another (Appellants) <i>v</i> Director of Public Prosecutions (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0198	Lord Neuberger Lord Sumption Lord Reed	Granted 21 Dec 2012  Refused 21 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be granted but limited to ground 1. For the avoidance of doubt, we include in ground 1 the question of whether the test is based on apparent lawfulness.  THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused on grounds 2 to 4.
Pusey and another (Appellants) <i>v</i> Somerset County Council (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0195	Lord Neuberger Lord Sumption Lord Reed	Refused 21 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law.

Peifer (Appellant) <i>v</i> Western Education and Library Board and another (Respondents) (Northern Ireland) UKSC 2012/0224	Lady Hale Lord Wilson Lord Carnwath	Refused 21 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law and in relation to the point of European Union law raised by or in response to the application it is not necessary to request the Court of Justice to give any ruling, because the answer is so obvious as to leave no scope for any reasonable doubt.
The Hospital Medical Group Limited(Appellant) <i>v</i> Westwood (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0202	Lady Hale Lord Wilson Lord Carnwath	Refused 21 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law.
In the matter of L-B (Children) UKSC 2012/0263	Lady Hale Lord Clarke Lord Wilson	Granted 21 Dec 2012	
Deutsche Bahn AG and others (Respondents) <i>v</i> Morgan Crucible Company plc (Appellant) UKSC 2012/0209	Lord Mance Lord Clarke Lord Sumption	Granted 21 Dec 2012	
Brito and another (FC) (Appellants) <i>v</i> Secretary for State for the Home Department (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0200	Lord Mance Lord Clarke Lord Sumption	Refused 21 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law of general public importance which ought to be considered by the Supreme Court at this time, bearing in mind that the case has already been the subject of judicial decision and reviewed on appeal.
French (Appellant) <i>v</i> Carter Lemon Camerons LLP (Respondent) UKSC 2012/0243	Lord Mance Lord Clarke Lord Sumption	Refused 21 Dec 2012	THE COURT ORDERED that permission to appeal be refused because the application does not raise an arguable point of law of general public importance bearing in mind that the case has already been the subject of judicial decision and reviewed on appeal.